Women Moderating Extremism in Pakistan

Written by Sarah Chatellier with Dr. Shabana Fayyaz

From August 2010 to August 2012, The Institute for Inclusive Security implemented a program in Pakistan with support from the US Institute of Peace titled Pakistani Women Moderating Extremism. The initiative supported the formation of a national coalition of women leaders dedicated to curtailing extremism and promoting social cohesion. This first policy brief of a two-part series explores the impact of extremism on Pakistani women, illustrates the critical role that women play in moderating it, and provides policy recommendations for how to support Pakistani women's peacebuilding efforts and address radicalization and extremist violence.

Extremism in Pakistan

Pakistan is at a crucial juncture as it struggles to contain rising extremism, achieve political stability, and uphold the rule of law. Plagued by geopolitical, ethnic, and sectarian-driven violence, Pakistani citizens continue to experience volatile insecurity and devastating loss of life. According to the Pakistani government, “Terrorism and Islamist militancy have taken about 35,000 Pakistani lives since 2001, including some 5,000 security personnel, and cost the country up to $100 billion in material and financial losses.”¹ In 2011 alone, there were about 3,000 recorded instances of violent attacks—on average, more than 8 every day—resulting from ethno-political violence, terrorist attacks, operations by security forces against militants, inter-tribal and cross-border clashes, and drone strikes. Such violence killed more than 7,000 Pakistanis and injured another 6,700,² rendering Pakistan’s internal conflict “among the deadliest in the world,” rivaling those in both Sudan and Iraq.³
The definition of extremism varies broadly, its causes are many, and its consequences are devastating to Pakistan’s moral fabric and overall stability. According to focus group discussions held with Pakistani citizens in 2011, “extremism” ranges from the absence of tolerance and rejection of others’ beliefs to the oppression of different religious groups in the name of Islam to the use of terrorist violence to force a mindset, ideology, or world-view on others. Education curricula, the media, religious sermons, and political rhetoric illustrate—and widely disseminate—extremist attitudes. For instance, recent studies of the public education system in Pakistan note that many mainstream school curricula openly purport “hatred of India and Hindus” and foster narrow worldviews that sanction violence as a means of resolving disputes.

At a minimum, intolerant beliefs have infiltrated mainstream norms and polarized Pakistani society, leading to visible animosity toward religious and ethnic groups, social exclusion, and increasing violation of basic human rights, especially of women and minorities. Worse still, extremist violence has increasingly pervaded the country. While sectarian and ethno-political conflicts roil Sindh and Punjab provinces, Balochistan has witnessed an alarming rise in disappearances, kidnappings, and targeted executions of non-Baloch settlers stemming from a 60-year old nationalist movement. Heavily armed tribal militias and the Taliban continue to terrorize communities in The Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK), while military operations to expel Islamic militants in the Swat valley in 2009 killed approximately 118 Security Force personnel, 212 citizens, and 1,300 Taliban fighters. The operations also uprooted roughly one million civilians, many of whom remain internally displaced with no homes or access to education and basic human services. Suicide bombings remain a constant threat, even in major metropolises such as Islamabad, Karachi, and Lahore.

The rise of extremism in Pakistan stems from various internal and external factors. It can largely be tied to the country’s legacy of unresolved disputes with India; General Zia ul-Haq’s campaign to Islamize the country in the 1970s; the backlash of the 1980s Afghan War, where the US funded and armed mujahedeen to oust the Soviets, who were then left to their own devices after the US withdrew from the region; the exploitation of religion by actors seeking to achieve influence in South Asia; and the state’s “patronage of militant groups to secure geo-strategic objectives in Kashmir and Afghanistan.”

In the 1990s, the country experienced historically
unprecedented growth in poverty, combined with the decline of democratic governance and oversight, which reinforced extremist tendencies. This period also witnessed a rise in sectarian and ethnic violence on a scale never seen before. In its 65 years of independent existence, Pakistan has vacillated between civilian and military rule and thus has struggled to establish stable democratic institutions. Consequently, political and socioeconomic factors—such as poor governance; corruption; insufficient rule of law; gender, economic, and education disparities; unequal distribution of resources; and misinterpretation and exploitation of religion by state and non-state actors—have bred conditions that led to the rise of extremism and continue to fuel radicalization. Subsequently, most “Pakistanis still feel excluded from politics, educational opportunities, jobs, and justice.” It is this frustration, destitution, and social exclusion that extremists are “exploiting so successfully in Pakistan today.”

Extremism’s Impact on Women

In the face of intensifying extremism and terrorist violence, women in particular are experiencing high levels of insecurity. While many women are well-educated, economically independent, and politically active, “feudal and tribal practices still control the lives of tens of millions of Pakistani women.” By placing a heavy emphasis on safeguarding women’s honor, religious fundamentalists have increasingly limited their rights and mobility, and subsequently their access to education, healthcare, and economic opportunities. Further, parallel Islamic legal systems that serve as justice-dispute mechanisms in many parts of the country are largely discriminatory toward women: “purdah, child marriage, and karō kari—the custom of raping, maiming, or even killing a woman suspected of having unsanctioned contact with a man—are not uncommon in the countryside.” Gross gender biases toward women have subsequently resulted in gross economic and educational disparities: Pakistan has one of the highest literacy gender gaps and women’s education status and workforce participation is among the lowest in the world.

Rising extremism has only compounded women’s marginalization. In addition to prevalent violence against women and increasing limitations on their participation in public life, terrorist violence has infiltrated almost all communities: the conflict has literally come to women’s doorsteps. Suicide bombers regularly target public markets that women must frequent to sustain their families. Their workplaces have been bombed, as have their children’s schools. Women in volatile KPK province noted that their children have stopped playing outside or accompanying them on errands for fear of attacks. According to a director of a school in Peshawar, “When I say goodbye to my family in the morning, I never know if one of us will not return home that night.”

In especially acute cases, such as in the Swat valley, the Taliban issued a fatwa against women working; they were also banned from leaving their homes without the accompaniment of a male relative. In addition to the severe health risks this poses to women needing medical attention as well as the
economic strain this causes families, the Taliban’s influence has entirely disrupted social life—women are perpetually afraid of reprisal and many are depressed from the isolation. Extremist violence is taking a devastating toll on the nation’s emotional and psychological well-being. As the mainstays in families and communities, Pakistani women are particularly impacted by the social disruption and violence caused by conflict.

Women as Agents of Change

Like in most parts of the world, women in Pakistan hold enormous sway over decision making within the home. As mothers and teachers, they play a predominant role in raising children and instilling them with values. Women are typically “the first to recognize signs of resignation and anger in children” or “when their sons, daughters, or husbands exhibit tell-tale signs of violent ideologies.” Because of their role both within the family and civil society, women are strategically placed to serve as a voice of reason and temper radical beliefs before they take root, as well as to bridge the social divides that contribute to violence. They are also more often attuned to the needs of their communities and have a large stake in promoting peace for their personal and family’s well-being. Similarly, because they are frequently targets of radical ideologies and violence, women are all too aware of extremism’s dangerous effects and are best positioned to do something about it. Subsequently, women are often the first to propose creative, nonviolent solutions to prevent and resolve conflict—and to act in the face of disaster or rebuild after it strikes.

Pakistan has no dearth of women working to address “the political grievances, socio-economic injustices, and power imbalances that are among the root causes of extremism,” as evidenced by their active involvement in grassroots movements, civil society, and government around these issues. Since 2008, the Pakistani parliament passed 24 laws to protect women and children largely due to efforts by the Women’s Parliamentary Caucus and the National Assembly’s woman speaker. Likewise, women’s groups have been “an important bulwark against the unbridled Islamization of society.” Since the founding of Pakistan, they have pushed back against “conservative religious leaders who emphasize a traditional role for …and condone detrimental cultural practices toward women.” For instance, women’s groups campaigned tirelessly for the repeal of the Hudood Ordinances, which were passed in 1979 under General Zia to implement elements of Sharia law that are largely discriminatory toward women and radical in punishment. Due to women’s advocacy efforts, the National Assembly passed the Women’s Protection Bill in 2006 to reform the ordinance.

However, Pakistani women are not only countering religious fundamentalism to protect their rights; they are also mobilizing against extremism in its various forms to restore stability and bring about peace in their country. For instance, women leaders from across Pakistan formed a diverse coalition dedicated to collectively moderating extremism. In early 2011, Amn-o-Nisa (which means “peace through women” in Urdu) launched a public campaign to curtail violent extremism and promote social cohesion in communities across the country. The coalition advocates for policy reforms to specifically address extremism in three sectors: security, reconstruction and rehabilitation, and mediums of indoctrination (to encompass both formal and informal education, such as the media). Members are also promoting tolerance, pluralism, interfaith harmony, and civic engagement by conducting outreach and awareness-raising activities at the grassroots level with youth groups, civil society organizations, the media, religious leaders, and educators.

Examples of their efforts to build a more peaceful, secure country include:

- Advocating for curriculum reform to replace education materials that reinforce extremist values with ones that promote tolerance and diversity;
Women Moderating Extremism in Pakistan

Members of Amn-o-Nisa (second and third from left) moderate a roundtable discussion they organized with Pakistani academicians and researchers to engage them in a dialogue about rising extremism and encourage the academic community to play a more proactive role in promoting peace and pluralism. (Photo courtesy of PAIMAN Alumni Trust.)

- Holding conversations with religious leaders and scholars to promote better understandings of peaceful Islamic values and dispel misinterpreted ideologies;
- Facilitating dialogues with women’s and youth groups, teachers, political parties, and religious leaders to encourage dialogue about extremism and brainstorm solutions for how to address it in their communities;
- Creating student peace clubs in primary and secondary schools, who serve as role-models and mediators in classrooms;
- Hosting television and radio talk shows with people affected by conflict to draw attention to extremism’s negative, and increasingly deadly, consequences;
- Forming youth peacekeeping groups and training them in conflict resolution skills to mediate local disputes and prevent violence;
- Working with mothers of militants to deradicalize and reintegrate extremist youth in society; and
- Helping youth recruited by violent extremists access psychosocial support, alternative job skills training, and employment opportunities.

Through advocacy and community outreach, members of Amn-o-Nisa are taking concrete actions to reduce radicalization and promote peace. As evidenced by their efforts to raise awareness about extremism, and to devise and implement creative solutions that address its root causes and consequences, women in Pakistan are a critical resource for preventing, resolving, and transforming their country’s multifaceted conflicts.

Recommendations

Despite the important contributions of Pakistani women to tempering extremist voices, preventing and resolving crises, and rebuilding communities affected by violence, national and international policymakers largely do not recognize women’s roles as peacebuilders, which has contributed to a lack of access for women with keen insight about conflicts to relevant decision-making circles. This exclusion has significantly weakened efforts to combat violent extremism because it has resulted in the creation of policies that do not accurately address the root causes of radicalization or the needs and concerns of conflict-affected communities. The active involvement of Pakistani women in shaping policies—especially related to security and development—is therefore critical to bring about a more stable, secure, prosperous country. It is similarly crucial to support Pakistani women’s efforts to build peace and promote them as moderating forces within the country.

To enhance US development, security, and countering violent extremism initiatives, as well as increase Pakistani women’s influence in shaping policies in these arenas, Amn-o-Nisa developed the following recommendations for relevant US actors:

1. The US ambassador should convene monthly meetings with US diplomatic, development, intelligence, and military communities, as well as with women leaders working to moderate extremism, including Amn-o-Nisa, to
seek their insights into policies and practices to counter violence. The US Embassy should regularly report on the outcomes of these gatherings.

2. The Department of State and the US Agency for International Development should provide support to women’s coalitions by funding their deradicalization efforts—including advocacy initiatives, community outreach programs, and capacity building projects—and providing protection mechanisms for women’s rights defenders working in conflict affected areas.

3. USAID and the State Department should fund and support initiatives that rehabilitate and build the livelihood skills of women survivors of extremist violence, especially women-heads of household. These initiatives should provide:
   a. Access to justice and legal counseling;
   b. Access to trauma care and psychosocial counseling;
   c. Opportunities for economic empowerment;
   d. Access to microcredit loans; and
   e. Support for families, including childcare, education, and healthcare.

4. USAID and the State Department should support and fund Pakistani civil society training initiatives, within each province and FATA, that build the capacity of media on gender-sensitive reporting in conflict situations. Additionally, USAID and State should fund women civil society organizations to train media on the impact of extremism and women’s role in countering violence. All trainings should include at least 30 percent local-language media and at least 30 percent women.

5. The State Department and USAID should continue to allocate funds to Pakistani civil society organizations dedicated to reforming curricula and developing educational materials that promote tolerance, conflict transformation, interfaith dialogue, and respect for human rights, especially women’s rights:
   a. The US Department of State should ensure the implementation of curriculum reforms proposed by civil society through a targeted diplomacy effort with the Government of Pakistan;
   b. USAID should fund the reconstruction of girls’ schools in conflict-affected areas and provide incentives to women teachers and students; and
   c. USAID should fund and support an initiative to build the capacity of all teachers on topics of conflict transformation and peacebuilding.

6. The Bureau of International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs, USAID, and other relevant organizations should partner with the Ministry of Interior and women’s civil society groups to prevent and respond to violent extremism by:
   a. Conducting a needs assessment on the capacity of Pakistani law enforcement agencies to deal with extremist violence;
b. Developing training materials for law enforcement officials that address the impact of extremist violence on women and how to engage with women civil society organizations in their efforts to counter violent extremism;

c. Ensuring that 25 percent of law enforcement trainers and trainees are women;

d. Supporting women civil society organizations, in partnership with the National Disaster Management Authority and the Provincial Disaster Management Authorities, in identifying, nominating, and training first responders in every district to react to incidents of extremist violence and terrorism, specifically addressing the needs of women and girls; and

e. Developing gender-responsive, indigenous early warning and response systems.

To address violent extremism, enhance women’s ongoing efforts to build social cohesion, and increase women’s participation in peace and security processes, Amn-o-Nisa developed the following recommendations for Pakistani policymakers:

**Security**

1. The Senate and National Assembly Standing Committees on Interior should incorporate women into the proposed bill for establishment of the National Counter Terrorism Authority, ensuring that women will be appointed to 30 percent of the NACTA seats, following which the committees should approve the bill.

2. The Senate and National Assembly Standing Committees of Interior must ensure that the draft bill calls for a special focus on researching and addressing the impact of violent extremism and terrorism on women within NACTA’s Terms of Reference and Scope of Work.

3. The Ministry of Interior must immediately review the personnel composition of civilian law enforcement agencies to ensure that they include 30 percent women.

4. The Ministry of Interior must conduct an immediate needs assessment specifically for women police stations and women law enforcers to provide them with the necessary tools, equipment, and resources for efficient performance of their duties.

5. The Ministry of Interior, the National Police Bureau, and the National Police Academy must ensure capacity building and skill development of law enforcement officers so they are able to deal with women survivors as well as women perpetrators during incidents of violent extremism and terrorism.

6. The Ministry of Interior, the National Police Bureau, and the National Police Academy must conduct trainings for capacity building and skills development, particularly of women law enforcement officers, for efficient media liaising and public handling during incidents of violent extremism and terrorism.

**Mediums of Indoctrination and Education**

1. The Provincial Departments of Education and the Provincial Text Book Boards must include topics related to peace and tolerance, including interfaith harmony, in curricula at the primary and secondary levels. Textbooks and other teaching materials should reflect the contributions of Pakistani women to their society.

2. The Provincial Departments of Education should incorporate peace and tolerance into the professional development courses for teachers. Women organizations working on these issues should develop those courses and materials together.
3. Civil society organizations invested in addressing extremism, especially women's groups, in partnership with media development organizations, should create a media watchdog committee to ensure compliance with the existing code of conduct.

4. Media development organizations, along with civil society organizations, should develop media literacy activities for youth and children in schools, colleges, and universities on the impact of extremism.

Reconstruction and Rehabilitation

1. To identify and acknowledge victims of violent extremism and terrorism, and to provide survivors with adequate compensation, the Federal Ministry of Interior, along with the Provincial Ministries/Departments of Social Welfare and Women Development, should map, collect, and consolidate data of the conflict affectees, especially women, youth, and other vulnerable groups.

2. The National Disaster Management Authority, and where applicable, the concerned Provincial Disaster Management Authorities, should review their respective policy frameworks to acknowledge women's role as agents of change in moderating extremism and to ensure specific attention is paid to the needs of women and youth affectees of violent extremism and terrorism.

3. The NDMA and PDMA/FDMA (where applicable) should appoint and support a gender adviser to integrate the roles, needs, and concerns of women survivors of violent extremism and terrorism in all phases and levels of reconstruction and rehabilitation.

4. The National Crisis Management Cell, the NDMA, and the PDMA/FDMA (where applicable), through an inclusive and consultative process, should develop a strong mechanism for monitoring and evaluation, as well as analysis, of reconstruction and rehabilitation activities for women and youth affected by violent extremism and terrorism.

5. The Prime Minister and the Cabinet, in coordination with the provincial governments and women's organizations, must develop a National Policy for Reconstruction and Rehabilitation, along with a national strategy. The proposed national policy must focus on women and youth affectees of violent extremism and terrorism and recognize women's leadership in advancing social cohesion.

6. The Provincial Departments of Home and Interior, District Coordination Officers, and District Police Officers/Capital City Police Officers, along with community-based organizations and other stakeholders should identify and nominate first responders in every district to react to incidents of extremist violence and terrorism, specifically addressing the needs of women and girls.

7. The Provincial Departments of Women Development and Social Welfare must ensure the accessibility and availability of women crisis centers in conflict-affected areas to provide trauma care, psychosocial support, and skills for rehabilitation.

8. The Provincial Education Departments should conduct a needs assessment in order to reconstruct demolished schools and construct new schools for girls in conflict-affected areas according to the needs of the community. The departments should also provide enhanced training for female teachers with incentives to work in post-conflict areas and ensure continued education for girls.
9. Civil society organizations, especially women’s groups working on peace and security, should partner with relevant military and civilian authorities to conduct an independent evaluation of ongoing deradicalization efforts, including centers such as Sabaoon and Raastoon. Furthermore, engage women and youth groups in advancing similar efforts with appropriate modifications.
Endnotes


12. Ibid.


15. Ibid, p. 130.

16. Ibid.


24 Ibid.


26 Amn-o-Nisa was formed with support from The Institute for Inclusive Security and the US Institute of Peace in April 2011. Members come from all four provinces of Pakistan, as well as from the Federally Administered Tribal Areas and Azad Jammu and Kashmir. They also represent a variety of professional sectors, including academia, civil society, government, and the media. For more information, visit: http://www.huntalternatives.org/pages/8881_pakistan_women_s_coalition_against_extremism_launches_publicly_october_2011.cfm.


29 In accordance with existing national and international commitments of the Government of Pakistan, such as the National Action Plan on Women, Peace, and Security, Gender Reform Action Plan, National Policy on Development and Empowerment of Women, and CEDAW.

30 With support from European Union (EU) and German Technical Cooperation (GTZ).